

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF WEST VIRGINIA  
CHARLESTON DIVISION**

<b>IN RE: ETHICON, INC. PELVIC REPAIR SYSTEM PRODUCTS LIABILITY LITIGATION</b>	<b>Master File No. 2:12-MD-02327 MDL No. 2327</b>
<hr/> <b>THIS DOCUMENT RELATES TO:</b>  <i>Beth Harter v. Ethicon, Inc., et al.</i> <b>Case No. 2:12-cv-00737</b>	<b>JOSEPH R. GOODWIN U.S. DISTRICT JUDGE</b>

**JOINT DESIGNATION OF NON-PTO FILINGS**

Ethicon, Inc. and Johnson & Johnson (collectively, “Ethicon”) and Plaintiff Beth Harter (“Plaintiff”), by and through their respective counsel, pursuant to this Court’s December 15, 2016 Order [ECF No. 120], hereby jointly designate the following non-Pretial Order documents from MDL No. 2327, 2:12-md-2327, to transmit to the United States District Court for the Western District of Virginia:

<b>Date Filed</b>	<b>ECF No.</b>	<b>Docket Entry</b>
08/31/2012	238	FIRST AMENDED MASTER LONG FORM COMPLAINT AND JURY DEMAND
08/31/2012	239	MASTER ANSWER AND JURY DEMAND OF DEFENDANT ETHICON, INC. TO FIRST AMENDED MASTER COMPLAINT
08/31/2012	240	MASTER ANSWER AND JURY DEMAND OF DEFENDANT ETHICON LLC TO FIRST AMENDED MASTER COMPLAINT
08/31/2012	241	MASTER ANSWER AND JURY DEMAND OF DEFENDANT JOHNSON & JOHNSON TO FIRST AMENDED MASTER COMPLAINT
04/20/2016	1977	MOTION by Ethicon, Inc., Johnson & Johnson to Exclude the Opinions and Testimony of Scott A. Guelcher, Ph.D. in Wave 1 Cases
04/20/2016	1981	MEMORANDUM OF LAW by Ethicon, Inc., Johnson & Johnson, Inc. in support of 1977 MOTION by Ethicon, Inc., Johnson & Johnson to Exclude the Opinions and Testimony of Scott A.

		Guelcher, Ph.D. in Wave 1 Cases
04/20/2016	1987	MOTION by Ethicon, Inc., Johnson & Johnson to Exclude the Opinions and Testimony of Duane B. Priddy, Ph.D. in Wave 1 Cases
04/20/2016	1989	MEMORANDUM OF LAW by Ethicon, Inc., Johnson & Johnson in support of 1987 MOTION by Ethicon, Inc., Johnson & Johnson to Exclude the Opinions and Testimony of Duane B. Priddy, Ph.D. in Wave 1 Cases
04/21/2016	2014	MOTION By Certain Plaintiffs in Wave 1 Cases to Limit the Opinions and Testimony of Jaime L. Sepulveda-Toro, M.D.
04/21/2016	2018	MEMORANDUM OF LAW by Certain Plaintiffs in Wave 1 Cases in support of 2014 MOTION By Certain Plaintiffs in Wave 1 Cases to Limit the Opinions and Testimony of Jaime L. Sepulveda-Toro, M.D
04/21/2016	2038	MOTION by Ethicon, Inc., Johnson & Johnson to Exclude Certain General Opinions of Jerry Blaivas, M.D. in Wave 1 Cases
04/21/2016	2039	MOTION by Certain Plaintiffs in Wave 1 Cases to Exclude the Opinions and Testimony of Shelby Thames
04/21/2016	2040	MEMORANDUM by Ethicon, Inc., Johnson & Johnson in support of 2038 MOTION by Ethicon, Inc., Johnson & Johnson to Exclude Certain General Opinions of Jerry Blaivas, M.D. in Wave 1 Cases
04/21/2016	2042	MEMORANDUM by Certain Plaintiffs in Wave 1 Cases in support of 2039 MOTION by Certain Plaintiffs in Wave 1 Cases to Exclude the Opinions and Testimony of Shelby Thames.
04/21/2016	2052	MOTION by Ethicon, Inc., Johnson & Johnson to Exclude Certain General Opinions of Bobby Shull, M.D. in Wave 1 Cases
04/21/2016	2055	MEMORANDUM by Ethicon, Inc., Johnson & Johnson in support of 2052 MOTION by Ethicon, Inc., Johnson & Johnson to Exclude Certain General Opinions of Bobby Shull, M.D. in Wave 1 Cases
04/21/2016	2060	DAUBERT MOTION by Certain Plaintiffs in Wave 1 Cases to Exclude the Opinions of FDA Expert Timothy Ulatowski
04/21/2016	2065	MEMORANDUM by Certain Plaintiffs in Wave 1 Cases in support of 2060 DAUBERT MOTION by Certain Plaintiffs in Wave 1 Cases to Exclude the Opinions of FDA Expert Timothy Ulatowski
04/25/2016	2100	MOTION by Ethicon, Inc., Johnson & Johnson, Inc. to Substitute Amended Exhibit A to 1977 MOTION by Ethicon, Inc., Johnson & Johnson to Exclude the Opinions and Testimony of Scott A. Guelcher, Ph.D. in Wave 1 Cases
04/25/2016	2101	MOTION by Ethicon, Inc., Johnson & Johnson, Inc. to Substitute Amended Exhibit A to 1987 MOTION by Ethicon, Inc., Johnson & Johnson to Exclude the Opinions and Testimony of Duane B. Priddy, Ph.D. in Wave 1 Cases
04/26/2016	2106	ORDER granting 2100 MOTION by Ethicon, Inc., Johnson & Johnson, Inc. to Substitute Amended Exhibit A to 1977 MOTION by Ethicon, Inc., Johnson & Johnson to Exclude the Opinions and Testimony of Scott A. Guelcher, Ph.D. in Wave 1 Cases
04/26/2016	2107	ORDER granting 2101 MOTION by Ethicon, Inc., Johnson &

		Johnson, Inc. to Substitute Amended Exhibit A to 1987 MOTION by Ethicon, Inc., Johnson & Johnson to Exclude the Opinions and Testimony of Duane B. Priddy, Ph.D. in Wave 1 Cases
05/07/2016	2134	RESPONSE by Ethicon, Inc., Johnson & Johnson in opposition to 2060 DAUBERT MOTION by Certain Plaintiffs in Wave 1 Cases to Exclude the Opinions of FDA Expert Timothy Ulatowski
05/07/2016	2138	OPPOSITION by Ethicon, Inc., Johnson & Johnson to 2014 MOTION By Certain Plaintiffs in Wave 1 Cases to Limit the Opinions and Testimony of Jaime L. Sepulveda-Toro, M.D.
05/09/2016	2150	RESPONSE by Certain Plaintiffs in Wave 1 Cases in opposition to 2052 MOTION by Ethicon, Inc., Johnson & Johnson to Exclude Certain General Opinions of Bobby Shull, M.D. in Wave 1 Cases and 2055 Memorandum In Support
05/09/2016	2164	RESPONSE by Certain Plaintiffs in Wave 1 Cases in opposition to 1977 MOTION by Ethicon, Inc., Johnson & Johnson to Exclude the Opinions and Testimony of Scott A. Guelcher, Ph.D. in Wave 1 Cases
05/09/2016	2168	RESPONSE by Certain Plaintiffs in opposition to 1987 MOTION by Ethicon, Inc., Johnson & Johnson to Exclude the Opinions and Testimony of Duane B. Priddy, Ph.D. in Wave 1 Cases
05/09/2016	2176	MEMORANDUM by Certain Plaintiffs in Wave 1 Cases in opposition to 2038 MOTION by Ethicon, Inc., Johnson & Johnson to Exclude Certain General Opinions of Jerry Blaivas, M.D. in Wave 1 Cases
05/09/2016	2187	RESPONSE by Ethicon, Inc., Johnson & Johnson in opposition to 2039 MOTION by Certain Plaintiffs in Wave 1 Cases to Exclude the Opinions and Testimony of Shelby Thames
05/16/2016	2218	REPLY by Ethicon, Inc., Johnson & Johnson to 2178 Memorandum In Opposition.
08/08/2016	2508	OPPOSITION by Ethicon, Inc., Johnson & Johnson to 2014 MOTION By Certain Plaintiffs in Wave 1 Cases to Limit the Opinions and Testimony of Jaime L. Sepulveda-Toro, M.D.
08/25/2016	2649	MEMORANDUM OPINION AND ORDER (Daubert Motion re: Timothy Ulatowski) The court GRANTS in part, DENIES in part, and RESERVES in part the 2060 DAUBERT MOTION by Certain Plaintiffs in Wave 1 Cases to Exclude the Opinions of FDA Expert Timothy Ulatowski, as more fully set forth herein
08/25/2016	2657	MEMORANDUM OPINION AND ORDER (Daubert Motion re: Duane B. Priddy, Ph.D.) The court DENIES in part, GRANTS in part, and RESERVES in part the 1987 MOTION by Ethicon, Inc., Johnson & Johnson to Exclude the Opinions and Testimony of Duane B. Priddy, Ph.D. in Wave 1 Cases, as more fully set forth herein.
08/26/2016	2667	MEMORANDUM OPINION AND ORDER (Daubert Motion re: Jerry Blaivas, M.D.) The court DENIES in part, GRANTS in part, and RESERVES in part the 2038 MOTION to Exclude Certain

		General Opinions of Jerry Blaivas, M.D., as more fully set forth herein.
08/30/2016	2682	MEMORANDUM OPINION AND ORDER (Daubert Motion re: Jaime L. Sepulveda-Toro, M.D.) The court DENIES in part, GRANTS in part, and RESERVES in part the 2014 MOTION By Certain Plaintiffs in Wave 1 Cases to Limit the Opinions and Testimony of Jaime L. Sepulveda-Toro, M.D., as more fully set forth herein
08/31/2016	2698	MEMORANDUM OPINION AND ORDER (Daubert Motion re: Scott A. Guelcher, Ph.D.) The court DENIES in part, GRANTS in part, and RESERVES in part the 1977 MOTION by Ethicon, Inc., Johnson & Johnson to Exclude the Opinions and Testimony of Scott A. Guelcher, Ph.D. in Wave 1 Cases, as more fully set forth herein.
09/01/2016	2711	MEMORANDUM OPINION AND ORDER (Daubert Motion re: Bobby Shull, M.D.) The court DENIES in part, GRANTS in part, and RESERVES in part the 2052 MOTION by Ethicon, Inc., Johnson & Johnson to Exclude Certain General Opinions of Bobby Shull, M.D. in Wave 1 Cases, as more fully set forth herein
09/02/2016	2723	MEMORANDUM OPINION AND ORDER (Daubert Motion re: Shelby Thames, Ph.D.) The court DENIES in part, GRANTS in part, and RESERVES in part the 2039 MOTION by Certain Plaintiffs in Wave 1 Cases to Exclude the Opinions and Testimony of Shelby Thames, as more fully set forth herein
10/06/2016	2880	MOTION by Certain Plaintiffs in Wave 1 Cases to Strike Dr. Shelby Thames' Supplemental Reports or, in the Alternative, for Leave to File a Daubert Motion Based on the Flawed Methodology Employed Therein
10/20/2016	3018	RESPONSE by Ethicon, Inc., Johnson & Johnson in opposition to 2880 MOTION by Certain Plaintiffs in Wave 1 Cases to Strike Dr. Shelby Thames' Supplemental Reports or, in the Alternative, for Leave to File a Daubert Motion Based on the Flawed Methodology Employed Therein
11/03/16	3105	NOTICE OF MOTION and MOTION by Certain Plaintiffs in Wave 1 Cases for Reconsideration of the Court's [2667] Memorandum Opinion and Order Limiting or Excluding the Expert Opinions of Dr. Jerry Blaivas, M.D.
11/03/16	3106	MEMORANDUM by Certain Plaintiffs in Wave 1 Cases in support of [3105] MOTION by Certain Plaintiffs in Wave 1 Cases for Reconsideration of the Court's [2667] Memorandum Opinion and Order Limiting or Excluding the Expert Opinions of Dr. Jerry Blaivas, M.D.
11/17/16	3225	<i>Docket Text:</i> RESPONSE by Ethicon, Inc., Johnson & Johnson in opposition to [3105] MOTION by Certain Plaintiffs in Wave 1 Cases for Reconsideration of the Court's [2667] Memorandum Opinion and Order Limiting or Excluding the Expert Opinions of Dr. Jerry Blaivas, M.D.

Submitted: December 22, 2016

/s/ Susan M. Robinson

Susan M. Robinson (WVSB # 5169)  
Thomas Combs & Spann, PLLC  
300 Summers Street, Suite 1380  
P.O. Box 3824  
Charleston, WV 25338-3824  
(304) 414-1800  
srobinson@tcspllc.com  
*Attorneys for Defendants Ethicon, Inc.  
and Johnson & Johnson*

/s/ Fidelma Fitzpatrick

Fidelma Fitzpatrick  
Jonathan Orent  
321 South Main Street  
Providence, RI 02903  
(401) 457-7700  
ffitzpatrick@motleyrice.com  
jorent@motleyrice.com

Fred Thompson  
Motley Rice LLC  
28 Bridgeside Blvd.  
Mount Pleasant, SC 29464  
(843) 216-9000  
fthompson@motleyrice.com  
*Attorneys for Plaintiff Beth Harter*

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF WEST VIRGINIA  
CHARLESTON DIVISION**

<b>IN RE: ETHICON, INC. PELVIC REPAIR SYSTEM PRODUCTS LIABILITY LITIGATION</b>	<b>Master File No. 2:12-MD-02327 MDL No. 2327</b>
<b>THIS DOCUMENT RELATES TO:</b>  <i>Beth Harter v. Ethicon, Inc., et al.</i> Case No. 2:12-cv-00737	<b>JOSEPH R. GOODWIN U.S. DISTRICT JUDGE</b>

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that on December 22, 2016, I electronically filed the foregoing document with the Clerk of the Court using the CM/ECF system which will send notification of such filing to CM/ECF participants registered to receive service in this MDL.

/s/ Susan M. Robinson  
Susan M. Robinson (WVSB # 5169)  
Thomas Combs & Spann, PLLC  
300 Summers Street, Suite 1380  
P.O. Box 3824  
Charleston, WV 25338-3824  
(304) 414-1800  
srobinson@tcspllc.com